

the 1990s. The chapter heads the topic of migration to the United States since the 1940s as one of the major factors that have brought prosperity but also inequality to the inhabitants. It gives an overview of the annual traditional fiestas and the participation of the faithful of the diverse religions. Migrants to Tacoma, Washington, reproduce Catholic fiestas in the new destination when they cannot travel to their hometown, and they always contribute to the community celebrations sending remittances. "By replacing the hierarchy of cargos with fiesta cost-sharing, Catholics in Tzintzuntzan have prevented Chamula-style caciques from rising to power" (39).

Chapter two focuses on the reasons for conversion in the 14 churches visited during the fieldwork. Within a place pervaded with alcoholism among males, female converts find the evangelical message very appealing. This chapter accounts for the different manner in which communities in Chiapas (Chamula) and in Tzintzuntzan deal with religious diversity. Although the author describes the history and development of all new evangelical churches as well as of the Catholic, he fails to distinguish Pentecostal from Mainline or Historic Protestant churches or the Jehovah's Witnesses. A brief description of each type would have been useful for readers who are not familiar with the topic. American scholars tend to dismiss or ignore part of the literature written in Spanish by Latin American analysts who have researched non-Catholic churches since the 1980s.

In chapter three, Cahn tackles an old battle within the field of religious studies, demonstrating in the process that successful Evangelical churches are not necessarily associated with coercive (and foreign) missionary tactics. Chapter four discusses the consequences of religious diversity on local Catholicism, which has begun to borrow traits from Evangelical churches in order to reinforce its doctrine and practice. The Catholics sympathize with the Evangelicals and criticize the excess of money spent in fiestas (104, 106).

"Responding to the Majority: Doctrinal Disobedience" is the title of chapter five. Here Cahn examines the different levels of doctrine and practice between religious leaders and the faithful. Drawing from daily life examples the author demonstrates that converts "do not separate themselves from the rest of the community" and are "more aware than their pastors of the benefits of cultivating positive relations with their neighbors" (122); therefore they occasionally disobey the church rules without disrespecting their leaders. Similarly, Catholics can disagree with the rigid positions of the priests and respond with criticism and disobedience, such in "the throwing of Corpus Christi" (137). Both type of believers have an inclusive religious behavior; "interfaith understanding occurs in both directions" (125).

In chapter six, Cahn discusses the consequences of conversion and contextualizes his study in order to contest some of the given assumptions regarding the destruction of traditions in the communities, the political participation of evangelicals, and changes in gender roles. Although the author shows evidence from all the religious groups studied about women being

excluded from leadership and playing subordinate roles, his argument is not totally convincing because religion in general but mostly marginal religions always offer free spaces for women to resist, challenge, and contest power.

In the conclusion, Cahn starts developing further his theoretical argument regarding the interfaith understanding of Tzintzuntzan. Not convinced with the model of "spiritual toolbox," a bricolage, or "religion à la carte," which explains religious mobility as if testing or choosing different products in the market according to flavors and circumstances, the author suggests a more inclusive model to explain the diverse religious options. His model should be less functionalist, and should not result in the fragmentation of the believers' identity. Believers in Tzintzuntzan do not consider the diverse creeds as products, but they think in terms of the positive attributes of all religions. "These flexible interpretations of faith do not weaken spiritual commitments, but rather strengthen them by inserting them in a larger social context" (168).

The book ends with the notes, bibliography, and index. It provides 13 photographs and two maps highly illustrative of the town life. The written style (in first person) makes the reading a real pleasure without lacking the rigor and depth of an academic work. Each section of the book has been elaborated interweaving the empirical data with a theoretical discussion, so that every relevant issue is thoroughly described and discussed. In summary, the book is an important contribution to the field of religious conversion and the study of Protestantism in Mexico and Latin America, in both as an ethnographic work and as a solid reflection on issues related to social, political, and economic consequences of religious diversity. Patricia Fortuny Loret de Mola

Campbell, Shirley F.: *The Art of Kula*. Oxford: Berg, 2002. 241 pp. ISBN 1-85973-518-5. Price: £ 15.99

The Trobriand Islanders of Papua New Guinea are famous for their highly ritualized kula trade. In his masterpiece "Argonauts of the Western Pacific" Bronislaw Malinowski (London 1922: 81) describes the kula as "a form of exchange . . . carried out by communities inhabiting a wide ring of islands, which form a closed circuit . . . articles of two kinds . . . are constantly travelling in opposite directions . . . long necklaces of red shell, called *soulava* . . . [and] bracelets of white shell called *mwali* . . ." To do the kula the Trobrianders use *masawa*-canoes to sail to the neighbouring islands. These canoes have exquisitely carved and painted prowboards and splashboards. Between September 1976 and March 1978 Shirley Campbell carried out fieldwork on Vakuta, the southernmost island of the Trobriand group, pursuing "at length the relationship between form, representation, colour association, and meaning of the kula outrigger canoe's prow and slashboards" (129). Now, 24 years later, she has published the results of her studies. Campbell states that her analyses are "concerned with the carvings produced by artists for consumption within their own so-

ciety and for which there is practical use and associated value ... [She enlists] the carvings placed on the kula outrigger canoes as consummate visual 'texts' defining how men would like their renown to be perceived. ... [Her] analysis explores the feedback generated between an artist and the community for which he works, his training, the value of his work as a practical object, and its power as a vehicle for symbolic representation" (5 f.).

The introduction gives an overview on the history of the Trobriand art of carving and previous ethnographic research on this topic. Campbell explicitly defines her approach to "the art of kula" as different from that of other authors; she is "concerned with describing the relationship of the carvings to Vakutan values and the meaning evoked by the designs within a purely Vakutan context" (5); she emphasizes that her research "concentrates on the system of meaning encoded in the kula canoe prow and slashboards" (6).

The book is divided into three sections. Part one outlines the social setting. Chapter 1 describes the Trobriands and their inhabitants, their contact experiences with Europeans from 1782 to the 1970s, the settlement patterns on Vakuta, the Vakutans' subsistence, their exchange patterns, their political organization, and the prototypical course of a day in their life.

Chapter 2 introduces the difference between carvers who carve with magic – the *tokabitam ginigini* or mastercarvers, and those that carve without it – the *tokataraki*. Then it provides the readers with a brief history of the artefact trade on the Trobriands.

Chapter 3 explores the process by which a mastercarver's apprentice becomes a *tokabitam ginigini* and the role of a mastercarver in Vakutan society. First the author differentiates three forms of knowledge that are essential for becoming such an artist: *nukwali* (general knowledge), *kateta* (specialised, personalised knowledge), and *kabitam* (knowledge of magic systems). Access to a mastercarver's knowledge is restricted, and only the best apprentice will get this knowledge from his master. Campbell then describes how a boy becomes a mastercarver's apprentice, what he has to do, and when he finally gets the *kabitam* in form of the *sopi* magic that enables the free flow of a master's carving patterns. This "initiation" to knowledge encompasses three stages. Then the apprentice has to learn how to make his tools, he is taught the qualities of various types of woods, and he has to learn the designs of the boards. When the master thinks that his apprentice is ready to apply what he has learned, he makes him carve 6 (non life-size) splashboards – the *lagim* – and prowboards – the *tabuya*. If the master finds the results perfect, he proclaims his apprentice a *tokabitam ginigini*.

Part two gives a formal analysis of the carving patterns on a *lagim* and on a *tabuya*. Chapter 4 analyses the cutting designs of the four boards. Each set of prows is distinguishable by formal markers. The author shows that the *tabuya* as well as the *lagim* carving patterns cover 5 sections of the boards. Campbell then describes the labelled forms that are carved into the various sections of the boards and explains the significance of

the different categories. This chapter provides excellent ethnography!

Unfortunately, this cannot be said of chapter 5, basically because the linguistics here (and throughout the volume) is just hopeless! To mention just two basic linguistic mistakes: Campbell neither understands the Kilivila system of numeral classifiers nor grasps the way of marking possession in Kilivila. This is difficult to understand, given the fact that since 1986 there has been a grammar and a dictionary of Kilivila available (G. Senft, *Kilivila – The Language of the Trobriand Islanders*. Berlin 1986). In this chapter the author examines the repertoire of representations (of animals, plants, etc.) and the meanings that are associated with the forms examined in chapter 4. The author's knowledge about these representations is impressive.

Chapter 6 discusses the role of the colours on the boards that constitute an additional important semiotic system. If one neglects the mistakes with respect to Kilivila color term semantics, this chapter thoroughly describes the colouring of the prows, how the colours are made, and their application on the boards. It remains unclear whether the section on colour symbolism presents the emic Vakutan symbolism or whether it is based on the author's hypotheses.

Chapter 7 examines the themes in each section of the boards. The author claims that "the *tabuya* features several representations that are concerned with success ..., flight ..., effective magic ..., the power of attraction ..., and wisdom" (138) and that the *lagim* features themes like "beauty," "power," "desire," "emotion," "consciousness," "density of magic," "flight," "speed," "knowledge," and "creative thought." The chapter ends with a discussion of the design units that encode multiple layers of meaning. Basically, these designs should contribute to the success of a kula expedition.

Part three of the book focuses on the rituals of the kula. Chapter 8 describes the processes involved in making a kula canoe, the departure and the return journey of a kula expedition, the actual kula transactions, and the overall meaning of the kula. The author concludes that the kula offers each man "the opportunity to achieve immortality through the renown of his name" (175).

Chapter 9 discusses "men's ideological characterisation of their relationship to women" (184) and defines the kula canoe as representing the mediation between land – the domain of women – and sea – the domain of men.

In the conclusion, Campbell summarises the analyses presented. She emphasizes that the "art of kula is a dynamic medium of communication in which the associated systems of meaning are integrated with others to reflect Vakutan spheres of social experience" (193). It encodes the specific Vakutan worldview.

The book ends with the notes, a glossary of Kilivila terms, a bibliography, and an index. The illustrations and the 18 photographs provided are highly informative. The book is well edited, there are hardly any typos.

In summary, some chapters of this book offer excellent ethnography. Despite its severe linguistic shortcom-

ings and despite the fact that it often remains unclear whether the author presents an emic or rather an etic analysis of the art of kula, the monograph is an interesting contribution to the ethnography of the Trobriand Islanders and the fascinating aspects of their indigenous culture.

Gunter Senft

Caplan, Pat (ed.): *The Ethics of Anthropology. Debates and Dilemmas*. London: Routledge, 2003. 235 pp. ISBN 0-415-29643-9. Price: £ 19.99

Pat Caplans Sammelband "The Ethics of Anthropology. Debates and Dilemmas" versteht sich als Auseinandersetzung mit den fachspezifischen Ethik-Codes amerikanischer und englischer Anthropologie. Dabei geht es Caplan um keine neue, interkulturell gültige Bestimmung von Ethik. Ihr Band erörtert weder die Konflikte der Globalisierung noch ethische Grundlagenprobleme, sondern die Verflechtung von Politik, Macht und Ethik, sowohl im hochschulpolitischen Umgang mit Ethik-Codes wie auch in der ethnologischen Feldforschung. Die Gültigkeit jener Normen, die das Selbstverständnis der abendländischen Aufklärung prägen und den Kern der Menschenrechtsidee ausmachen, wird hingegen weder interkulturell problematisiert noch sachlich begründet, sondern schlicht vorausgesetzt. Dies gilt auch für den einführenden Beitrag von David Mills, "Like a Horse in Blinkers? A Political History of Anthropology's Research Ethics", der an diversen Beispielen illustriert, dass die Ausbildung eines fachspezifischen anthropologischen Ethik-Codes vor allem in den USA als unmittelbare Reaktion auf politische Instrumentalisierungsversuche von ethnographischem Wissen verstanden werden kann. Zur Debatte steht also keine reflexive Begründung anthropologischer Ethik, sondern eher die Frage, wie der anthropologische Ethik-Diskurs seinerseits Ausdruck und Element politischer Machtverhältnisse ist.

Diese kulturgeschichtliche Perspektive auf das Verhältnis von Anthropologie und Ethik bildet den Fluchtpunkt einleitender "Debates", die nicht zuletzt eine aktuelle Bedeutungsverschiebung im anthropologischen Ethik-Diskurs thematisieren. Caplans und Mills' Interesse gilt der – noch kaum beachteten – Instrumentalisierung von Ethik im Rahmen der zeitgenössischen "audit culture", die auf die gegenwärtige Anthropologie umso mehr Einfluss gewinnt, als diese sich der politischen Forderung nach wirtschaftlich verwertbarem Wissen ausgesetzt sieht. Welch unsachgemäße Formen der Zwang zur ethischen Absicherung für die ethnologische Forschung mitunter annimmt, beschreibt Marilyn Silverman in ihrer Auseinandersetzung mit den Ethik-Fragebögen kanadischer Hochschulen, während Stephen Nugent Patrick Tierneys moralische Radikalkritik an den Yanomami-Forschungen von Napoleon Chagnon als ethisch verbrämten Diffamierungsversuch von dessen evolutionistischem Theorieansatz deutet. Mit der politisch gebotenen ethischen Rechtfertigung ändert sich, so Caplans bedenkenswerte These, die Bedeutung von Ethik für die Anthropologie insgesamt: Hatten ethische

Debatten ursprünglich das Ziel, eine selbstkritische Einstellung zur eigenen Wissenschaft auszubilden, die indigene Informanten vor der Vereinnahmung durch eurozentrische Interessen schützen sollte, so werden sie nun zu formalen Mechanismen des Selbstschutzes und damit ihrerseits zum Instrument politischer Machtausübung und inhaltlicher Steuerung von Wissenschaft.

Caplans Interesse an diesen machtpolitischen Verflechtungen des anthropologischen Ethik-Diskurses sowie an der Identitätskrise gegenwärtiger Anthropologie überhaupt knüpft unverkennbar an postmoderne Dekonstruktionsbemühungen an, deren erkenntniskritisches Problembewusstsein sämtliche Beiträge des Bandes prägt. Anders als in der "Writing Culture" Debatte geht es Caplan allerdings nicht um die literarische Reduktion von Anthropologie, sondern um die Aufdeckung jener praktischen Implikationen, die mit der ethnographischen Repräsentationskrise einhergehen: Neben die Auseinandersetzung mit den politischen Aspekten von Ethik sowie mit der ethischen Dimension ethnologischer Beschreibung und Deutung (s. dazu die Beiträge von Nigel Eltringham, Veronica Strang und Andrew Spiegel) tritt darum die Analyse jener Konflikte, in die der Ethnologe durch seine eigene Vorstellung von Wirklichkeit und Ethik während der Feldforschung gerät (s. dazu Lisette Josephides, Susan Greenwood, Gill Barber, Vasiliki Kravva). Die Verknüpfung von epistemologischer und ethischer Problematik – Caplan beruft sich dabei vage auf Martin Heidegger – orientiert sich an der Einsicht, dass das jeweilige Ideal rechten Handelns auf einem bestimmten Begriff von Wirklichkeit beruht. Theorie und Praxis, Erkenntnis und Ethik lassen sich demnach nicht voneinander trennen, sie gehören, so Caplans Grundthese, gerade in der Anthropologie konstitutiv zusammen.

Folgerichtig beschreiben die praktischen "Dilemmas" konkrete ethische Widersprüche, die beim Aufeinandertreffen konkurrierender handlungsleitender Weltanschauungen in der Praxis der Feldforschung entstehen: Gill Barber erläutert ihr Dilemma anhand eines Konflikts, in den sie einerseits als Anthropologin und andererseits als westlich ausgebildete Hebamme gegenüber einer indigenen Informantin und Hebamme aus Malawi gerät, als diese – aus Barbers Sicht – unverantwortliche therapeutische Maßnahmen angibt. Ihr ethnologisches Interesse an fremden Formen der Weltdeutung und die vom anthropologischen Ethik-Code gebotene Verantwortung für das ihr anvertraute geheime Wissen der indigenen Hebamme kollidieren mit der Überzeugung, über das bessere medizinische Wissen zu verfügen und die Forderungen des Ethik-Codes britischer Hebammen erfüllen zu müssen, die sich primär am Wohl der Gebärenden und ihres Kindes, nicht an der Verantwortung für die Informantin orientieren. Ein anderes Dilemma skizziert Nigel Eltringham anhand der Unmöglichkeit, eine Darstellung des Völkermordes in Rwanda zu leisten, die von allen Beteiligten gebilligt würde. Hier wird nicht nur die Wirklichkeitsdeutung des Ethnologen zum Problem, sondern ebenso die Tatsache, dass sich die traumatisierten Kontrahenten des indigenen Konflikts genau jener polyvokalen Repräsentation unterschiedli-